

## Common Mistakes In Writing Citation Found On English Students' Literature Review Thesis In English Education Program Of Muhammadiyah University Of Bengkulu

Mega Rahmadania<sup>1</sup>, Epi Wadison<sup>2</sup>  
<sup>1,2</sup> Muhammadiyah University of Bengkulu

Email : [niabkl670@gmail.com](mailto:niabkl670@gmail.com) [epiwadison@umb.ac.id](mailto:epiwadison@umb.ac.id)

### Abstract

The primary purpose of this research is describe about common mistakes in writing citation found on English Students' Literature Review Thesis in English Education Program of Muhammadiyah University of Bengkulu. The research design of this research used qualitative method. The instrument is using table checklist about mistakes in writing citation by APA Style 7<sup>th</sup> edition: *Direct Citation and Indirect Citation*. The result of this study showed that there were common mistakes in writing citation found on English Students' Literature Review Thesis. First, direct citation in book sources, most of English Students did not write page number as initial "p". Second, indirect citation from the book sources, most of the students did not write "as cite in" as characteristics in writing Indirect Citation. Third, Direct Citation from journals sources, most of English Students write Paragraph number using colon, not use initial "para" as in APA guiding style. Fourth, Indirect Citation from the journals sources, most of the English Students did not write words "as cite in" as a characteristics in writing indirect citation. Fifth, the common mistakes in writing Indirect Citation in English Students Literature Review Thesis from Book sources in single author, especially in writing page number. On the other hand, the common mistakes in writing Indirect Citation in English Students Literature Review from the book sources in single author especially in write the words "as cite in". The common mistakes in writing direct citation from the journals sources in single author in writing paragraph number, and the common mistakes in writing indirect citation from the journals sources in single author especially in write the words "as cite in".

**Key words:** Citation, literature review, academic writing

### INTRODUCTION

Thesis is one of academic writing which should be written by English students as one of prerequisite to graduate program of S1. The process of writing a thesis, the students will be guided by an advisor to check and give some advising from the beginning to finishing in writing a thesis. Thesis as a one of Academic Writing consist of expository text and argumentative text. According to Philips & Pugh (as cite in Monash University, 2014) a thesis consist of an argument or a series of arguments combined with the description and discussion of research you have undertaken. It means that thesis is a requirement for students to have some references quoted from textbooks, journals and articles to complete their writing. References cited in writing a thesis particularly they are written in Literature Review and they can be used as a concept and theories to support in writing a research. Webster & Watson (as cite in Levy & Ellis, 2006) defined an effective literature review as one that "creates a firm of foundation for advancing knowledge. It

facilitates theory development, closes areas where a plethora of research exists, and uncovers areas where research is need" (pp.182).

Some mistakes found in writing citation in Literature Review after doing preliminary observation to 8 English students' thesis. The real mistakes found that English Students in writing citation often using a colon to write the page number, not using initial pp as in APA style guide. The fact above, it can be concluded that some students still make mistakes in writing citation in Literature Review. So, the fact above are inspiring to conduct in order to know 'Common Mistakes in Writing Citation found on English Students Literature Review Thesis particularly in English Education Program of Muhammadiyah University of Bengkulu.

Related to explanation above, there are several previous studies that support to conduct this research such as, Review and Citation style in research article introductions: A comparative study between national and international English medium journals in medical science by Arsyad et.al (2018), the result of this research, there are more similarities than differences in the review and citation style. Citation practices of postgraduate students writing literature review by Badenhorst (2018), the results of this research is explore the citation patterns, complexity and discursive practices in master's students' Literature Reviews. An error analysis of students quotations in Literature Review on Thesis in English Study Program of Muhammadiyah University of Bengkulu by Veronika (2015), it found that many errors in writing quotations. In comparative study of citation style of Indonesia and International writers found in Journal Articles of TEFLIN and TEFL by Solekah (2015), There found were differences between Indonesian writers in TEFLIN and International writers in TEFL.

Previous research above, it can be broadening to understand other mistakes found in writing citation such as, how to write name of authors, year of publication, and page number. In doing this research, the data will use some copies of the English Students Literature Review who graduated in Academic Year 2020.

## **RESEARCH METHODOLOGY**

The main part of this research is involved examined on common mistakes in writing citation found on English Students Literature Review Thesis in English Education Program of Muhammadiyah University of Bengkulu. The method used in this research was qualitative research to identify and describe the cases by Maxwell (1996,p.17) stated that Qualitative research is the research that focused on the specific situation or people, its emphasis on words rather than numbers. Data of this project collected 35 theses written by English Students who graduated on October in Academic Year 2020. The instruments of this research was table checklist of direct and indirect citation based on APA guiding style 7th edition. In collecting the data, English students' theses copied at Muhammadiyah University of Bengkulu Library. These data were analyzed by employed some steps: read every literature review of the thesis to find information the mistakes in writing citation and then identified the mistakes referring to APA guiding style 7th edition. Third, i investigated the mistakes that found on English Students Literature Review thesis. And finally, the mistakes were grouped and calculated using Herzberg formula (1983):

$$P = \frac{F}{N} \times 100 =$$

Notes: P = Percentage  
 F = Frequency of Answer  
 N = Number of Student

**FINDING AND DISSCUSSION**

**FINDINGS**

**English Students Mistakes in Writing Direct and Indirect Citation from the Books**

**a. Mistakes in writing Direct Citation**

In this part, the researcher identify students mistakes in writing direct citation from books sources (single author, two authors, three authors). The mistakes display in the table below :

No	Part of Citation		Mistake s	Presentase %
1.	Single Author N = 225	Author Last name	45	71 %
		Year	25	
		Page number	90	
2.	Two authors N= 100	Author last name	10	69%
		Year	0	
		Page number	59	
3.	Three author N = 50	Author last name	9	24%
		Year	0	
		Page number	3	

From the table showed that displayed the data from the mistakes in writing citation from book souces in single author, two authors, and three authors. First, found almost half of the number of citations mistakes in writing citation from book sources that have single author the mistakes are in writing author last name found that 45 mistakes. Example of mistakes in writing citation author last name, are :

**Incorrect Citation (example)**

*"These six common functions in personal relationships. They are as follows according to Ting Tomey (1999)."*

**Correct Citation ( example based on APA Style)**

*"These six common functions in personal relationships. They are as follows according to Toomey (1999)."*

The researcher can conclude that in writing direct citation of book sources that have 3 part, as single author, 2 authors and 3 authors the most mistakes made by English students in writing citation is in book sources that have single author, because in single authors found 160 mistakes in writing author last name, year of publication and page number. Almost all of the criteria in writing citation mistakes made by students, but the most mistakes found in writing page number. The mistakes in occur because the students did not know how to cite book sources in

writing page number correctly based on APA guiding style whereas in write author last name and year of publication has followed APA guiding style.

**Mistakes in writing Indirect Citation**

In this part, the researcher identify students mistakes in writing indirect citation from book sources (single author and two authors). The mistakes display in the table below.

**Mistakes in Writing Indirect Citation of Book**

No.	Part of Citation		Mistakes	Persentase
1.	Single Author N=49	Author last name	9	67%
		Year	8	
		As cite in	9	
		Page number	7	
2.	Two authors N=21	Author Last name	3	38%
		Year	0	
		As cite in	5	
		Page number	0	
3.	Three authors N= 0	Author last name	0	0%
		Year	0	
		As cite in	0	
		Page number	0	

The table 4.2 displayed the data from the mistakes in writing citation from book sources in single author, two authors, and three authors. First, mistakes in writing indirect citation in book sources that have single author found that the mistakes in writing author last name found that 9 mistakes. Example of mistakes in writing indirect citation in writing author last name, is :

**Incorrect citation (example)**

*Satisfaction is seen as an expression of fulfilment of a expected outcome influenced by prior expectation regarding the level of quality. (Els Ekinci:2004 in Eyiah-Botwe, 2015).*

**Correct Citation (example based on APA style)**

*Satisfaction is seen as an expression of fulfilment of a expected outcome influenced by prior expectation regarding the level of quality. (Ekinci,2004 in Botwe, 2015).*

Based on the example above, in writing indirect citation from the book sources that have single author, in writing last name only write "last name" not full name, but the students stiiil write full name in writing indirect citation of book sources that have single author. Second, mistakes in writing indirect citation from the book sources that have single author found that 8 mistakes in write year of publication. The example of this mistakes is :

**Incorrect Citation (example)**

*Stune (1995) as quoted by Mulyasa (05) argues that teacher competency is as follows : descriptive of the qualitative nature of teacher behavior appears to be entirely meaningful.*

**Correct Citation (based on APA style)**

*Stune (1995) as quoted by Mulyasa (2005) argues that teacher competency is as follows : descriptive of the qualitative nature of teacher behavior appears to be entirely meaningful.*

**1.1.2 English Students Mistakes in Writing Citation from Journals**

**a. Mistakes in Writing direct Citation**

In this part, the researcher identify students mistakes in writing indirect citation from books sources ( single author and two authors). The mistakes display in the table below.

**Table 4.3 Mistakes in Direct Citation of Journal**

No.	Part of Citation		Mistakes	Persentase
1.	Single Author N=38	Author last name	15	63%
		Year	0	
		Paragraph number	9	
2.	Two authors N=51	Author Last name	5	21%
		Year	0	
		Paragraph number	6	
3.	Three authors N= 55	Author last name	3	5%
		Year	0	
		Page number	0	

The table 4.3 displayed the data mistakes in writing direct citation from the journals sources in single author, two authors, and three authors. First, mistakes in writing direct citation in journals sources that gas single author found that the mistakes in writing author last name found that 15 mistakes. Example of mistakes in writing direct citation in writing author last name, is :

**Incorrect Citation :**

*Pronunciation includes all those aspects of speech which make for an easily intelligible flow a soeech, including segmental articulation, rhythm, intonation and phrasing, and more peripherally even gesture, body language and eye contact (Jacob Fraser,2001 :6)*

**Correct Citation (example based on APA style)**

*Pronunciation includes all those aspects of speech which make for an easily intelligible flow a soeech, including segmental articulation, rhythm, intonation and*

phrasing, and more peripherally even gesture, body language and eye contact (Fraser,2001, para.6)

Based on explanation and example above, the researcher could conclude that in writing indirect citation of journals sources (single author, two authors, three authors) the most mistakes made by English Students in writing citation from the journals sources is in single authors, because in single authors the percentase mistakes is 63%. The most mistakes is located in writing paragraph number, because the students still write paragraph number as using colon. The mistakes is causes the students did not know how to cite a journals sources correctly based on APA guiding style, specifically in thesis guiding book also have no expkanation about how to cite the journals generally.

**B. Mistakes in Indirect Citation**

In this part, the researcher identify students mistakes in writing indirect citation from books sources (single author and two authors). The mistakes display in the table below :

**Mistakes in Indirect Citation of Journal**

No.	Part of Citation		Mistakes	Persentase
1.	Single Author N=36	Author last name	0	58%
		Year	0	
		As cite in	16	
		Page number	5	
2.	Two authors N=12	Author Last name	0	42%
		Year	0	
		As cite in	4	
		Page number	1	
3.	Three authors N= 7	Author last name	0	14%
		Year	0	
		As cite in	1	
		Page number	0	

The table 4.4 displayed the data mistakes in writing indirect citation from the Journals sources in single author, two authors, and three authors. First, mistakes in writing indirect citation in journals sources that has single author found the mistakes in writing citation especially in writing indirect citation in writing words as cite in , is :

**Incorrect Citation (example)**

According to Haris in Ernawati (2010), the aspect of speaking is related to fluency.

**Correct Citation ( example based on APA style)**

According to Haris as cite in Ernawati (2010), the aspect of speaking is related to fluency.

The researcher could conclude based on explanation above, in writing indirect citation from the journals sources (single author, two authors, and three authors) the most mistakes made by English Students in writing citation in Journals sources

that has single author, because in single author found 21 mistakes in writing citation from 36 citation and 58% in the percentage. This mistakes can occur because English students did not know how to cite journals sources especially in indirect citation, as we know in the thesis guiding book, there is no explanation about how to cite indirect citation in journals sources.

### **1.1.3 The Most Common English' Students Mistakes in Writing Citation from the Books and Journals.**

#### **a. Most Common Mistakes in Writing citation from Books**

There were 644 mistakes made by English Students in writing citation. The most common mistakes made by English Students in writing direct citation from the book sources in single author in writing page number. The researcher found that 160 mistakes from the 225 citation or 71%. It means that almost half of students made mistakes in writing page number in writing citation from the book sources.

Based on APA guiding style page number in writing citation must be written as initial "P". Unfortunately, English Students still write the page number by using a colon or ".". It is important to know with this things, it can give information for the reader that your citation taken from the books complete like by the author A, in year of 2020 and in page 75). This is clear better than write the page number by using colon.

The common mistakes made by English students in writing indirect citation from the book sources in single author in writing words "as cite in". The researcher found that 33 mistakes from 49 citation or 67%. It almost half students made mistakes in writing words "as cite in", because the students did not write words "as cite in" as a characteristics of writing indirect citation.

#### **b. Most Common Mistakes in Writing Citation from Journals**

In Journals, the researcher found the most common mistakes in writing direct citation in Journals same like in the writing citation from book, There is in writing paragraph number. From the 644 students made mistakes in writing citation to quote journal. It found 24 mistakes in writing paragraph number from 38 citation. In this mistakes, the students write paragraph number as a colon, there is no differences between page number and paragraph number. Based on APA guiding style in writing citation to quote a journal, the researcher must write paragraph number or line number because in journals sometimes there is no page number, to clarify the researcher must write paragraph number. By using paragraph number, it is clear that were students taken the idea of their citation.

The most common mistakes in writing indirect citation from Journals sources, it found 21 mistakes from 36 citation or 58%. In this mistake, the students did not write words "as cite in" in writing indirect citation, whereas words "as cite in" is one of characteristics to writing indirect citation, but the English students did not know how to write indirect citation based on APA guiding style.

## **DISCUSSION**

The objective of the research to find out common mistakes in writing citation found on English Students literature review thesis in English Education Program of Muhammadiyah University of Bengkulu. In discussion section, the researcher present more detail of the data had been collected. All of the data had found would be consulted to the theories

which serves as guideline for conducting this research. In this research, the researcher used APA style 7<sup>th</sup> edition theory.

First, the common mistakes in writing citation from the book sources in direct citation is on single author. Almost all of the criteria in writing citation from book sources that has single author is wrong made by English students, and the specifically mistakes found in writing page number. This mistakes occur because in writing citation English students just read and use thesis guiding book of Faculty of Teacher Training and Education of Muhammadiyah University of Bengkulu. Eventhough, in thesis guiding book has suggested to using APA style, but in Thesis guiding book also made mistakes in writing guidelines in write citation especially in writing page numbers.

Second, the common mistakes in writing citation from the book sources in indirect citation is also in single author. All of the criteria of mistakes in writing indirect citation made by English students, and the most specifically mistakes in writing indirect citation from the book sources is in writing words "as cite in". Almost half of students did not write words "as cite in" as initial that write indirect citation. This mistakes can happened because in thesis guiding book, there is no explanation about how to write indirect citation.

Third, the common mistakes in writing indirect citation from the journals source in single author. The most mistakes made by the students in writing paragraph number, the students use colon as initial to write paragraph number. Meanwhile in APA guiding style in writing citation the researcher must write page number, unfortunately in journal have no page number. So, APA style replace page number in Journal with paragraph number or line number. There is no differences between page number and paragraph number if only using colon. This mistakes is cause in thesis guiding book have no guidelines how to writing citation from the journal sources and the English students writing citation just only thesis guiding book.

Fourth, the comomo mistakes in writing indirect citation from the journals sources in single author. The most mistakes made by students in writing words "as cite in", the students always did not write words "as cite in" whereas words as cite in can make the readers knows that the idea is taking as indirect. It is clear if the researcher write words as cite in. The results of this mistakes is 19%.

Thus, this research brings different finding from the previous study conducted by Badenhorst (2018), who examined citation practices in student writing literature review, but this research just focus to improve the citation patterns in Literature Review. Furthermore, in comparative study of citation style of Indonesia and International writers found in Journals articles of TEFLIN nad TEFL by Solekah (2015). Contrary to above because the results is only talk about differences between writes in TEFLIN and TEFL, there is no specific explanation about what is the differences. Moreover the results of this research supported by Veronika (2015) she revealed that students made mistakes in writing direct and indirect citation.

From the understandings above, it can be conclude that APA guiding style of have own guide for each cite taken from books or journals, so there is differences between write page number in book and paragraph number



in Journal. APA style guide, the citation guide is clear, with use paragraph number as initial "para" the students or the reader know that the idea of citation taken from journal and if use page number as initial "p" the students or the reader know that the idea of citation is taken from the books.

Thesis Guiding Book not explain how to write citation from the journals, so the students writing citation from the journal same like writing citation from the book especially in writing page number or paragraph number in journal to be clear that there are differences between writing citation to quote journal or book.

Thesis guiding book also had no explanation about writing direct and indirect citation. It is make the students don't know how to write indirect and direct citation. It is make the students don't know how to write indirect citation, based on the result above, it can conclude that many mistakes made by English students cause the students did not know about APA guiding style, the students only focus on thesis guiding book and the students did not read or search another guiding like APA guiding styles as a guiding for citation in field of Education.

## **CONCLUSIONS AND SUGGESTIONS**

### **CONCLUSION**

Based on result and discussion in the previous chapter, it can be conclude that. The common mistakes in writing citation made by english students in writing direct and indirect citation found in quoted the book sources that has single author found in writing page number, In indirect citation the common mistakes that was found "as cite in" as initial that the citation is indirect citation. In write citation from journal sources, the common mistakes found in writing paragraph number in direct citation, which is in indirect citation, common mistakes found in writing words "as cite in" because the students dont know how to write citation.

### **SUGGESTIONS**

In the end of this research, the researcher would like to give suggestion for the english students, the advisors, and for the next researcher.

1. It is suggested for the students to read more thesis guiding book and learn more about how to write correct citation based on APA guiding style/
2. For advisors, it is suggested to pay attention the students in writing citation on literature review.
3. For the next researcher, it is hoped that the result of this research can be expended.

### **REFERENCES**

Abednia, et.al (2013).*Reflective Journal Writing : Exploring In-Service EFL Teachers Perception System.*

Anselmus(2020).*Incorporating Academic Writing Phrases into EFL Students Research Paper. International Journal of Learning, Teaching and Educational Research.*

APA STYLE 7th edition. American Psychological Association's Publication Manual.

Arsyad,et.al(2018).Review and Citation Style in Research Article Introductions : A comparative study between National and International English Medium Journals.*Medical Sciences*.

Bootes&Beile (2005).A Guide to Writing the Dissertation Literature Review. *UMASS Amherst*

Levy & Ellis(2006). A Systems Approach to Conudct an Effective Literature Review. *International Journal of an Emerging*

Lindsay(2016). A practical Guide to Acdemic Writing and Publishing

Monash University(2014). *Honours Thesis*

Murray.2006. Incremental writing: A model for thesis writers and supervisors. Educational and Professional Studie. *University of Strathclyde,UK*.

Solekah(2015).Comparative Study of Citations style of Indonesia and International Writers found in Journal Articles of TEFLIN and TEFL.