

## Students' Perception toward Supervisors' Written Feedback in Writing Thesis Proposal

Ivan Achmad Nurcholis  
Sentia Islamiati

Universitas Muhammadiyah Bengkulu

[Ivanacmad350@gmail.com](mailto:Ivanacmad350@gmail.com)  
[semtiaislamiati10@gmail.com](mailto:semtiaislamiati10@gmail.com)

### ABSTRACT

This research aimed to find out what are students' perception toward supervisor's written feedback in writing thesis proposal. The researcher used descriptive qualitative method. The subjects of this research were 20 students of eighth semester students who are preparing thesis proposal in 2021 Academic Year in English Education Study Program at Muhammadiyah University of Bengkulu. The researcher used observation checklist adapted from Wolflok's theory. The researcher used photos sent via WhatsApp media by 8th semester students as the subject of this study. The researcher used descriptive method to analyze the data. The result of this study showed that the perception of students in the feedback provided by the supervisor really helped them in correcting errors in a thesis proposal writing, especially when the supervisor provided constructive motivation in the form of suggestions or solutions. There were 4 types of feedback given by the supervisor when conducting guidance namely comments, circles and underlines, mark and correct and other signs.

**Keywords:** *Supervisor Feedback, Thesis Proposal Writing, Perception.*

### INTRODUCTION

In the final semester students are assigned by the university to write a thesis, which is supervised directly by the lecturer. The lecturer is directly selected and given the responsibility by the study program to assist students in writing thesis. Many students are afraid and anxious in writing a thesis, due to students who have never written a thesis at all. With the help of a supervisor, it is hoped that it can reduce the fear of students when they want to write a thesis. Each study program at the university has different policies in determining supervisors for final semester students in writing their thesis. After students know who their supervisor is, students will start contacting the lecturer to determine when to start thesis writing guidance. Usually at the beginning of the meeting the lecturer will tell students how long the thesis guidance will take in accordance with the provisions given by the study program. According to Rismen (2021), thesis writing is a final task that must be completed by students in undergraduate programs at universities. However, many students have difficulty in completing thesis writing, which is indicated by the feedback is in the form of criticism comments such as it is not clear what is written by students, the lack of supporting theories from journals or lecturers will provide suggestions that build the enthusiasm of

students to continue to be enthusiastic about writing theses, many students are less enthusiastic about writing theses, especially when they are always revision length of guidance they have taken.

According Woolfolk (1987) In written feedback, students' work needs to be corrected by commenting, marking and correcting. Lecturers often use circles, underlines or other signs to mark students' error. Written feedback is most effective in correcting the error of students in that they also give students constructive feedback and suggestions on enhancing their writing work.

There is other opinions that explain about feedback In detail, describe feedback that can be used to improve student performance with any knowledge of current behavior. Once they are given feedback on what they have learned, students will be able to improve their writing, Kauchack and Eggen (2020). Students need to be guided in when they are writing their thesis, they need correct or incorrect correction of their thesis writing. Every lecturer is obliged to provide corrections from the writing of his student thesis under his guidance, in order to assist students in correcting the errors contained in their writing.

It has been explained in the previous paragraph that writing a thesis is not easy, it takes high flying hours to quickly finish writing a thesis. Students have a supervisor who has been appointed from each study program. Lecturers and students conduct face-to-face guidance, when carrying out guidance between students and lecturers, students get feedback from their supervisors. In the form of suggestions and comments to improve the results of their thesis writing. This feedback is very important for students, so that the results of the supervisor's correction can be corrected by students. In feedback there is written feedback and verbal feedback. the importance of knowing about the feedback that occurs when lecturers and students conduct guidance. Many students think that written feedback providing comments and suggestions that are crossed out or circled directly by the supervisor is very effective for students, they are easy to understand and quickly correct the results of the correction from the supervisor.

Each student has a different perception of the feedback given by the supervisor when conducting guidance, in conducting the proposal guidance, it is certain that the student hopes to get the feedback given by the supervisor, the reasons of conducting the study research is because he wants to know the perception of each student about the feedback given provide a supervisor at the time of thesis proposal guidance who is working on proposal writing in the 8th semester of the 2021 academic year of the English language study program at the Muhammadiyah University of Bengkulu and wants to know the forms of feedback that each supervisor gives to students while doing guidance.

## **RESEARCH METHODOLOGY**

In this research, the researcher used descriptive qualitative method. According to Best and Khan (2006:24) stated that descriptive qualitative method uses to describing, recording, analyzing, and interpreting conditions that exist and statistical analysis is used to describe the results of the study. The subject of this research are all eighth semester students who are writing thesis proposals in The 2021 Academic Year. There were 20 students from the

2021 Academic Year in the English Education Study Program at Muhammadiyah University of Bengkulu.

Intrument The Research is Observation checklist method used in this study. Observation in a study is defined as focusing attention on object by involving all the senses to get the data. The instrument to be used in this study is observation checklist.

## RESULT

In thesis proposal guidance activities, supervisors need to provide feedback to students, such as comments, suggestions to make students able to correct mistakes in writing proposals that they make with feedback from their supervisors. The researcher used the theory of written feedback type by Woolfolk (1987).

The researcher determined that the research subject were 8th semester students there were 20 students who are writing thesis proposal. The results of the research conduct by the researcher will provide a form of written feedback given by the supervisor when conducting guidance and students' perceptions of the feedback given by the supervisor in the 8th semester of the English Education Study Program at Muhammadiyah University of Bengkulu. In this section, the researcher found several forms of feedback, written feedback given by the supervisor when guiding in making the thesis proposal, the form of written feedback given by the supervisor, some of which were comments, circles or underscores, suggestions and signs, other signs as needed according to Woolflok's theory. And the researcher will analyze how students perception about the supervisor when providing feedback during thesis guidance.

### 1. Table of Students perception

QUESTIONS OF THE INTERVIEW	Students Perception
What is your perception of the supervisor at the time of thesis guidance, does the feedback provided by the supervisor help you to correct errors in writing a proposal in each chapter or page marked with a correction by the supervisor? And what kind of feedback did your supervisor give you?	1. Of course it is very helpful, the supervisor provides comments on parts of each sentence or word that are still unclear, by commenting on the wrong parts and then the supervisor gives suggestions on how to improve it.
	2. My supervisor is certainly very helpful in improving the writing of the thesis proposal, checking each chapter, commenting on the wrong part, because if the supervisor does not provide written feedback on the proposal paper, I will be confused which part I will fix.
	3. Every time the my supervisor gives feedback in the form of comments that comment on the wrong parts, without providing a solution sometimes it creates confusion when I want to improve the writing, however, for me the feedback given by the supervisor is very helpful in improving the writing of the proposal.
	4. The supervisor provides feedback in the form of marking and correcting the parts which according to the supervisor are still unclear about the direction of the idea to be

	compiled into a paragraph, marking the wrong part and then providing suggestions or solutions, very helpful for improving the writing of the proposed proposal still wrong, the supervisor always provides feedback during guidance
	5. The form of feedback given by the supervisor is to mark and comment on each chapter, I think the feedback given by the supervisor is very important and of course very helpful.
	6. In my opinion, in providing feedback while being mentored, the supervisor is very helpful in correcting and marking the parts that are still wrong, such as errors in grammar, the supervisor will mark the part and will provide suggestions.
	7. The supervisor provides feedback in the form of marking the errors that are mark with circles or underscores in the parts that are still wrong, every time they want to provide feedback the supervisor asks what the purpose of writing is if it is still unclear what the meaning is, the supervisor will provide solutions that help to fix.
	8. Every time the supervisor does guidance, the supervisor asks what obstacles are encountered in writing the chapter sections, then the supervisor provides feedback in the form of marking errors by circling the parts that are still wrong and providing comments below in the form of solutions.
	9. Feedback is often given by the supervisor in the form of marking and correcting each page, marking the parts that are still wrong, providing comments on parts that are not right, while the guidance of the supervisor always gives advice in the form of motivation to quickly write a thesis proposal, so that there are no obstacles in passing on time.
	10. The supervisor marks the wrong part that is not right, such as not understanding the parts that will be written, not understanding the parts of each chapter that will start, after reading and marking the parts that are still not right, the supervisor provides a solution or in the form of helpful advice.
	11. By providing feedback from the supervisor, very helpful in correcting the parts that are still wrong in each chapter, the supervisor provides feedback in the form of marking and correcting each chapter.
	12. By providing feedback in the form of marking every wrong part, it is very helpful because they can know which parts will be corrected, the supervisor of course every guidance is very helpful, especially when they provide very constructive motivation to complete the thesis writing.
	13. Very helpful, being able to find out where the error is still not quite right, the supervisor provides feedback by checking each page or

	chapter and then marking it.
	14. The supervisor always provides constructive motivation to immediately finish writing the thesis, the supervisor is very helpful when providing feedback in the form of correcting each page and checking each chapter, marking the wrong parts, then providing suggestions in the form of solutions.
	15. Marking and correcting each chapter, giving motivation and advice each time guidance, is very helpful.
	16. At the time of guidance, the first thing the supervisor asked was what difficulties were in the parts of each chapter, giving feedback marking the parts that were still wrong and providing solutions, of course it was very helpful for every lecturer to provide feedback during guidance, because without that feedback, I don't know if it's correct or not every writing that has been done.
	17. Every time the guidance of the supervisor is very helpful by providing feedback, in the form of correcting each chapter and marking the wrong part in the chapter, of course it is very helpful for suggestions and solutions, especially the motivation that is always given by the supervisor, as if there is hope for finished on time.
	18. Feedback in the form of correcting each chapter, commenting on every word that is still grammatically wrong, marking parts that are still unclear and being asked to add parts that are still not correct. Of course the supervisor is very helpful.
	19. The supervisor gives advice every time after the guidance, the lecturer is very helpful in accelerating the completion of thesis writing by providing feedback on correcting each chapter.
	20. Very helpful, the supervisor provides advice and motivation every time the guidance, the supervisor provides feedback usually in the form of marking and correcting carefully each sentence and paragraph.

Of the 20 students who are working on thesis proposals in the 2021 academic year at the English language study program at Muhammadiyah University of Bengkulu, researchers analyzed students' perceptions of the feedback given by the supervisor during the thesis proposal guidance, from the table above it can be concluded that students' perceptions of feedback The feedback given by their supervisor is very helpful in correcting the parts of the error that exist in each chapter. Supervising lecturers always provide different forms of feedback to each child under their guidance, supervisors also always provide solutions and suggestions to help students. The supervisors who provide constructive motivation such as encouraging the work on proposal writing.

Every time they do guidance, students always get feedback from checking each chapter on the student's writing. Students feel that with this feedback, students feel there is a possibility that they will finish correctly in

their writing. As said to student 12 that by providing feedback in the form of marking every wrong part, it is very helpful because they can know which parts will be corrected, the supervisor of course every guidance is very helpful, especially when they provide very constructive motivation to complete the thesis writing. That the feedback given during the guidance really helps students to correct any mistakes in chapter parts, and other mistakes.

The researcher collected data used observation checklist, and the researcher found several forms of feedback given by the supervisor, namely: There are notes that must be corrected by students are: Student 2 "there are no indicators, and the grammar is not correct". Supervisor advice: student must complete language gather, in order to write well, even though it is commented, the supervisor corrects the wrong words, so that students can easily replace them.

Student 3 "the media used in teaching speaking online, online speaking materials, learning targets. Supervisor advice: the content must be in sync with the title, so from that the supervisor provides structures or designs that students will write.

Student 4 "page 22 previous research and page 23 how much data. Supervisor advice: there was a little problem in the previous research, it should be further strengthened with the latest year. And the data must be valid and more considered in determining the data.

Student 5 "page 1 words and sentences are not clear". Supervisor advice: students must make in their own language, so that it is more understandable. Do not copy paste via google translate.

Student 6 "data collection engineering section, and data analysis techniques". Supervisor advice: part chapter 3 the current is clear, because this is an important part and initial plan before searching and processing data. More written with care.

Student 7 "on page 4 there are words that are still wrong or not quite right, page 5 sentences and grammar is still not right". Supervisor advice: part in writing, grammar is very important for easier readers to understand. Use a language that is simple and understood by many people.

Student 8 "page 1 there are still many sentences that are not clear, and there are still many sentences that are still lacking to be used as a paragraph". Supervisor advice: careful in paragraph writing, learn to make more effective paragraphs.

Student 9 " in the research questions, background and questionnaire sections are still not correct, page 1 introductory paragraph is missing". Supervisor advice: more details in writing, do not rush. The questionnaire must be based on existing theory.

Student 10 "page 11 explanation sentences about speaking are not complete, page 18 about speaking has not been concluded with the

students' own opinions". Supervisor advice: data is suggested to be complete and making conclusions from own opinions more important.

Student 11 "in the questionnaire, students still did not understand and it was not clear what sentences were made". Supervisor advice: if using adapt, the questions are logical and based on theory.

Student 12 "supervisors provide feedback marking and correcting parts of words that are not clear to be used as sentences in the questionnaire". Supervisor advice: student should focus more on making questions.

Student 13 "sentences that have not been arranged neatly, pages do not exist". Supervisor advice: students should learn more in completing sentences, pages are also important parts that need to be made.

Student 15 "in the definition of key terms, the sentence structure is still wrong". Advisor's advice: in compiling sentences, it is necessary to think logically. Student 16 "page 23 on this subject". Supervisor advice: the subject must be clear.

Student 17 "the page has not been changed, the research questions are not clear, the research objectives are still unclear and there are grammatical errors, the use of capital letters is still wrong and the example part of writing sentences is still wrong". Supervisor advice: grammar things should first attention to meaning it will not be confused.

Student 18 "the grammatical error of each sentence is still not quite right". Supervisor advice: language procedure must be correctly completed.

Student 19 "page 1 introductory paragraph is not yet available, the significance of the research is still unclear, the writing in the previous research is still wrong, the instrument part is still incomplete". Supervisor advice: in writing the background it should be more detailed and complete.

Student 20 "the background is not clear, the introductory paragraph does not exist, the instrument and the research design section are not the same". Supervisor advice: learn more in writing, make beautiful and easy to understand sentences.

So, based on the explanation above, the researcher concludes that during guidance, the supervisor's feedback on students refers more to marking and correcting in writing paragraphs using good and correct grammar, choosing a language that is simple and easy to understand.

In addition, to strengthen the data, the researcher also conducted interviews. Based on the interviews conducted by the researcher with 10 students of the english study program who had taken proposal seminar courses, most (80%) of the students answered that there was some positive feedback or built given a supervisor to his students. While the rest (20%) answered when doing guidance, only marking the wrong parts and no solutions were given to mahstudents so that they were confused when

making improvements. The students admitted that feedback through writing is easier and simpler, because students only give proposals and some lecturers give good feedback. As student 2 said, "my supervisor always comments or responds and provides solutions if an error occurs in my proposal writing". Moreover, student 17 mentioned "my supervisor always checks one page or chapter at a time, then gives input in the form of suggestions".

This paper presents the written guidance effect of supervisor feedback on four aspects: commenting, marking and correcting, circle marks, underlines, or other marks to mark student errors. Feedback on MC (correcting and marking) counts the highest proportion, up to 100%, followed by CU (circle mark), up to 80%. Woolfolk (1987) also claimed in their research that teacher feedback focused more on correcting and marking or underlining and circling the wrong word. It can be seen that the main focus of supervisor feedback is on MC and CU, and students make more mistakes in these two aspects than in the others. Proportion of suggestions given in or other marks 0% remains at the lowest place. The feedback in the comments is 65%. (See Table 2).

**Table. 4.2.3**

Item	Total	Percentage
C	3	15%
MC	11	55%
CU	6	30%
OS	0	0%
Total	20	100%

So the result of this research are majorities of students experience errors when doing guidance. Even about the four forms of feedback based on Woolfolk (1987), the most dominated are MC, also few students complained about the mistakes they have made, because the majority of lecturers are making the most. That is why dominant final levels of students are often guarantee both online or offline. The positive response given by the supervisor really help students to learn better.

## DISCUSSION

This research is about Students' perception toward supervisor written feedback in thesis proposal writing student perceptions at the English Education Program, Muhammadiyah University of Bengkulu in the 2021 Academic Year who are writing thesis proposal. The first research question in this study was how the form of feedback given by the supervisor at the Muhammadiyah Bengkulu University English Education Program based on Woolflok (1987).

In accordance with the research questions above, there are 4 items that are used in the form of feedback given by the supervisor such as, making comments, giving circles and underscores, marking and correcting the wrong part and of course providing solutions or suggestions to correct errors in thesis proposal writing. This is supported by Woolflok (1987) the feedback given when conducting guidance between lecturers and

students is very important, because students will more easily find out where their mistakes are in thesis proposal writing.

## CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTION

Based on the results and question in the previous chapter, the researcher concluded that the perceptions of 20 students in the 2021 Academic Year in English Education Study Program at Muhammadiyah University of Bengkulu who are writing proposals on the written feedback provided by their supervisors greatly helped them in correcting errors in writing thesis proposal, especially when the supervisor provides constructive motivation in the form of suggestions or suggestions, marking the parts that are still wrong, giving the correct explanation for the parts that are still wrong. Woolflok's theory explained that there are 4 forms or types of written feedback given by the supervisor to mentored students.

Comments, Supervisors provide comments when conducting thesis proposal guidance with students. The supervisor provides comments with suggestions or solutions for improving the writing of the student proposals under his guidance.

Circles or Underlines the part that is not right, Supervisor mark the parts that they think are incorrect, such as grammatical errors or incomplete sentences, and circle parts of the page and punctuation that are still incorrect.

Mark and Correct , Marking the wrong part in each chapter, paragraph and sentence that is still not well and beautifully arranged according to the students' writing ideas according to the theory they understand, And Other Signs.

Suggestion Regarding the results of research and discussion as well as the conclusions that have been presented, the researcher gives some suggestions as follows: For students, With this research, it is essential for students to receive written feedback from their supervisors. By providing corrections to marking the wrong part, comments and suggestions as well as solutions provided by the supervisor will help students to improve their writing proposal.

## REFERENCES

- Asisa, N. (2021). *THE ANALYSIS OF STUDENTS' PROBLEMS ON WRITING THESIS (A Descriptive Research Design at 8*.
- Bryan, W. J., & Brown, L. (2019). *achieved . " " Life has no limitations except the ones we make ."*.
- Feedback, O., Class, W., Education, E., Education, E., & Kunci, K. (n.d.). *STUDENTS ' PERCEPTIONS ON WRITTEN AND ORAL FEEDBACK IN WRITING CLASS Ma ' idatur Rofiqoh Nur Chakim Abstrak*.
- Ismail, A. Bin, Na, M., Faizzah, N., & Dollah, D. (2009). Relationship between supervisor's role and job performance in the workplace training program. *Analele Științifice Ale Universității »Alexandru Ioan Cuza« Din Iași. Științe Economice*, 56(1), 237–251.
- Lazuwardiyah, F. (2021). *Teachers ' Feedback To Develop Students ' Critical Thinking in English Academic Writing At Uin Sunan Ampel Surabaya*.
- Patanduk, S. T. (2017). Students' Perception Toward Politeness and Impoliteness of the Lecturers of English Department at UKI TORAJA. *Tefl Overseas Journal*, 5(3), 104–119.

Supriyadi, S., & Kholid, M. R. (2020). Focused Written Feedback on Developing Quality Bachelor's Thesis Proposal. *Tadris: Jurnal Keguruan Dan Ilmu Tarbiyah*, 5(2), 265–274. <https://doi.org/10.24042/tadris.v5i2.5469>