

An Analysis of An English Textbook “English in Mind Second Edition - Students’ Book 3” for The Tenth Grade of The Vocational High School Based on Ur’s Criteria

Gita Anggreyni, Kiagus Baluqiah

Abstract

This research had an objective to find out whether the English textbook of technical vocational high school is suitable for Ur's criteria. The method used in this research was a descriptive quantitative method. The object in this research was an English book at the Vocational High School (SMK) entitled English in Mind Second Edition – Student's book 3. The data were analyzed by the instrument of this research namely a table checklist consisting of a good criteria of English textbook by Ur (1996). The findings showed that the textbook met the criteria by Ur (1996) with a score of 55. It means that this textbook has level of a fair textbook, so this textbook could be used for technical vocational high school. This textbook fulfilled 11 criteria of 20 criteria by Ur (1996). Meanwhile, 9 criteria were unavailable in the textbook. Therefore, it is a challenge for the teacher in using the textbook for English teaching and learning. The teacher should complete the unavailable criteria of textbook by adding the materials or media from others. Finally, the researcher suggests that this research can be references to find detailed information about this textbook by using other theories of textbook assessment.

Keywords: English Textbook, Suitability, Ur’s criteria.

A. Introduction

In Indonesia, English has become one of the most widely taught foreign languages in Indonesia formal school. English subjects are still intact as one of the national curricula. As time has passed since 2014, there has been a change in the curriculum in Indonesia, a new curriculum called curriculum 2013 or K-13, has been implemented in all schools in Indonesia. The 2013 curriculum it self is different from the previous curriculum called KTSP (School Based Level Curriculum). The implementation of this new curriculum requires adaptation in various aspects, including textbooks.

Specific requirements and regulations must be followed by the school project to achieve the objectives of the 2013 curriculum including syllabus, lesson plans, teaching materials, and classroom teaching strategies. One of the regulation set by the government is the Regulation of the Minister of National Education and Culture (permendikbud) number 71 of 2013 article 1. The regulation states that the government provides textbooks for teacher and students for subjects. Based on this policy, all schools must use textbooks based on the 2013 curriculum developed by the government. These textbooks can be easily downloaded from the Ministry of Education and Culture website.

To meet the needs of learning English, various textbooks are available that can be used by both teachers and students. Anderson (2007) in Mutiara Ayu and Rita Indrawati (2018) defines content analysis as applicable to various studies including language studies, which is concerned with analyzing the content of certain materials thorough classification, tabulation and evaluation.

The aim of learning English is to achieve the competencies targeted by teachers both in High School and in Vocational High Schools. For instance, in learning English, students must be able to master some important components of communication that will be conducted namely speakers, listeners, and utterances (Suhadi et al., 2021). Baluqiah & Fransiska (2020) specified three factors that affect the successful of teaching and learning process to achieve the aim namely students, lecturer and material. Moreover, the achievement of competences may depend more on many components, such as teachers, students, media, classroom, schools' infrastructure, teachers' instructions, availability of appropriate teaching materials, and others. Teaching and learning objectives will be achieved if all these components are met because they are interconnected, in teaching and learning activities the teacher requires the media used to perfect teaching.

Teaching and learning is a process of delivering knowledge, skills and attitudes from teacher to students in the classroom (Nurcholis et al., 2021). Teaching and learning activities in the classroom cannot be separated from the important role of teaching materials. The Minister of National Education suggests that teaching materials are learning materials used to help students learn. The material in question can be in the form of written material or unwritten material. By using teaching materials, the learning process in the classroom will be better and the learning objectives are easier to convey by the teacher and students will better understand the teaching materials they will learn. Textbooks are a form of media or teaching materials used by teachers to help maximize the learning process in the classroom. Media is one component that has an important role in the teaching and learning process, especially English. One of the media is a textbook which is widely used by teachers as a guide in the teaching English. Textbooks are designed by the government claiming that they meet curriculum requirements, syllabus, student needs in addition to textbooks providing a source of ELT material available for teachers to focus on doing the actual teaching work. Textbooks must be in accordance with the applicable curriculum, school syllabus with the needs of students and the aims and objective of teaching.

A textbook is one of the most important media for teachers and students. Teachers can plan teaching materials systematically and efficiently because textbooks provide goals and objectives for each lesson. Teachers can prepare and develop learning materials and classroom activities effectively. As for students, textbooks can help them as a reference in learning so that they can do independent study outside of schools' session. Textbooks are important because they greatly affect the learning process in the classroom.

In learning English, the most frequently used teaching materials are textbooks. The number of uses of textbooks is caused by several factors. First, textbooks are one of the affordable teaching materials when compared to other teaching materials. Textbooks are also very easy to obtain and sell commercially. Second, textbooks have an important role in academic growth and can support the success of students in the learning process at all levels of education (Azizifar et al.2010) in (Ari Hidayat 2020). Third, textbooks are very helpful as a guide and supporter in the teaching and learning process (Ur, 1991:184). Fourth, Nurdeani (2014) argues that

textbooks are very important for teachers who are not able or not ready to make their own teaching materials based on good textbook writing standards.

According to Cunningsworth (1995) many difficulties were found in choosing the right textbooks and teaching materials. He added that since the availability of various kinds of English textbooks with various publishers, it has become a challenge to determine the right choice of textbooks.

Thus, if the textbook does not match the criteria for a good textbook, the learning objectives will not be achieved. According to Riangsari (2015: 2) in (Ari Hidayat 2020) 'the fact is that textbooks that are used supposed to help the learning process actually have material substance that is not correct and has an impact on students' confusion in the learning process.' This means that there are still some books that are not in accordance with the needs of students or with the criteria of a good textbook. Therefore, teachers must be selective in choosing textbooks. In addition, the teachers must also be able to teach well after choosing the right textbook. They must be able to take advantage of the role of textbooks as supporting teaching materials in the learning and teaching process. The combination of a good textbook and the expertise of a teacher will be an important factor to achieve learning objectives and improve student achievement. Students without a textbook will depend on the teacher (Ur, 1991: 184).

Based on the previous explanation, the researcher is quite interested to analyze the English textbook, especially the English textbook used in vocational high school because of its English learning objective. Vocational school has really crucial English learning objectives to be used directly in their work field. Students are required to gain the ability/competency in using language for communication especially related to their work field later. In this case, the researcher selects to analyze the textbook used in teaching learning English at vocational high school entitled "English in Mind (Second Edition) Student's Book 3".

A textbook affects the achievement of learning objectives. If the textbook match the criteria for a good textbook, the learning objectives of vocational school will be achieved. Considering that the textbook is important for learning objective, this study aims to know whether the English textbook of the technical vocational high school followed the criteria of a good textbook. In this study, the researcher uses Ur's theory to assess how good the textbooks because the theory consists of all aspects including internal and external aspects of the textbooks.

B. Research Methodology

The design used in this research was a descriptive quantitative method. The object in this research was an English book at the Vocational High School (SMK). The book used was English book entitled English in Mind Second Edition – Student's book 3 published by the Curriculum and Books Center, Research and Development Agency and Books, Ministry of Education, culture, research and technology. The instrument of this research was a table checklist consisting of a good criteria of English textbook by Ur (1996). The data collection techniques of in this study were document analysis techniques and note-taking techniques. In document analysis technique, the researcher analyzed the English textbook in

accordance with the criteria of a good textbook based on Ur theory. Then, the researcher used the note-taking techniques as a companion to the document analysis method.

The analysis was carried out systematically and logically starting from reading, viewing and reviewing the available data. After all the data had been studied and examined, in addition to reviewing the data, then the next step was coding, namely giving certain codes or marks that were important points or things related to the discussion of this research. After coding, the next step was compiling the results of the coding in a relationship pattern so that was easy to understand. In addition, the researcher continued to count the score of table checklist on 'Yes' column which showed how much the textbook fulfilled the criteria. The formula for the score can be seen as follows (Suryani, 2015).

$$\text{Score} = \frac{\text{Total 'Yes' Checklist}}{\text{Maximal 'Yes' checklist}} \times 100$$

After that, the researcher interpreted the score to know how good the textbook is based on the scoring categories adapted from Reinildis Atjina Cyntia Rynanta and Suharmanto Ruslan (2013) cited in Suryani (2015) below:

Table 1. Scoring Category of Textbook Criteria

Range of Score	Category
10-40	Poor
41-60	Fair
61-80	Good
81-100	Excellent

C. Findings and Discussion

Findings

In analysis the textbook, the researcher followed several criteria proposed by Ur (1996). It aims to find out whether the English textbook of technical vocational high school is suitable to Ur's criteria. The result of data analysis showed the number of available criterion in the textbook marked by checklist on 'Yes' column is 11. Meanwhile, the unavailable criterion consists of 9 criteria which are not fulfilled by the book. The score can be counted by the following formula.

$$\text{Score} = \frac{11}{20} \times 100 = 55$$

The score of the textbook assessment is 55, so the textbook is categorized as a fair textbook based on the scoring category of textbook criteria. The criteria fulfilled by the textbook are;

1) The approach is educationally and socially acceptable to the target community

The textbook entitled English in Mind Second Edition – Student's book 3 contains the approach which is educationally and socially acceptable to students of vocational schools. The approach of this book is contextual approach where students are oriented to improve their skill in listening, speaking, reading and writing. Thus, the approach of the textbook is acceptable to students because this book focuses on four skills (listening, speaking, writing and reading). So it is beneficial in their daily life.

2) The layout is clear and attractive (the print is easy to read)

The layout of the textbook entitled English in Mind Second Edition – Student's book 3 is clear and attractive. It is clear because the words and picture sizes are acceptable and readable. It is also attractive because the book is colorful. Every picture has realistic color and it is suitable based on the context of the textbook. All units have clear and attractive layout.

3) Appropriate visual material is available

All units in the book contain appropriate visual material. Every unit must contain picture as visual material in order to direct students to the material.

4) The materials contain illustration and picture that can help the students to understand the topic clearly

All units in the textbook provide the materials with the illustration and pictures, so students can understand the topic clearly. For example, the picture shows an elephant. Elephant is one of the animals. Thus, the picture of elephant is suitable with the title of the text namely "Talk to the Animals". It means that students can recognize the what the topic meaning is based on the picture easily. It is very helpful for students.

5) The topics and tasks are interesting

All units provide the interesting topics and tasks based on high school students level of SMK. The topic of the book is interesting because it is very close to the students' daily lives. Moreover, it is followed by many clear and colourful pictures. Besides, the task is also interesting because there are some games and pictures of the task which make it clear and understandable to complete.

6) The instruction is clear

All units provide the interesting tasks followed the clear instruction, so students can easily understand what to do. There are some examples of how to answer the question based on the instruction before the students answers the question or practice the task.

7) The content is clearly organized and graded

All units provide the clear contents which are organized and graded. It provides materials and they are graded by task. There are listening and speaking activities (spoken) and reading and writing activities (written) followed by materials and tasks from easy to difficult. In this book, every activity on unit begins with reading or listening activity.

8) There is periodic review and test section

All units provide periodic review and test section. It can be seen that each unit must have review and test section periodically. For example, it can be marked by sub title "Check your progress". The book provides the test to review students' understanding of the materials. The book provides the review and test in four skills, vocabulary and grammar knowledge.

9) There is plenty of authentic language

All units have a lot of authentic language as the approach used in the textbook namely contextual approach. The approach influences the language. It must relate to students' real life or their daily life conversation such as mobile phone conversation, shopping, playing, working, etc.

10) It encourages learners to develop own learning strategies and become independent in their learning

All units encourage learners to develop own learning strategies because this book mostly provides interesting task and pictures without

completed explanation of the topic lesson. This book encourages students to be independent in looking for wider learning sources. Students need to find many materials out of the book because this book only present little explanation of the topic and even there is nothing at all. However, this book provides many tasks to complete.

11) It is readily available locally

This book has been one of book collection in local library of the school. It is proved by the book which is from school library and owned by school. Moreover, this book has been sold locally with the affordable price.

Meanwhile, there are 9 criteria that are not fulfilled by the textbook, namely;

1) The objectives are explicitly laid out in an introduction and implemented in the material

There is no introduction in the book, so the objectives cannot be seen and implementation as well. It can be seen on the picture of content list on page iv below. The textbook provides preface, map of student's book and followed by all units directly.

2) The topics and tasks are varied and differentiated based on learners' levels, learning styles, interest, etc.

This criterion is suitable with the principle of the latest curriculum nowadays, but this book is not suitable for the principles. The syllabus and the book are not connected each other. Based on the syllabus, the materials are such as the text of narrative, descriptive, procedure, exposition, recount, report and so on. Meanwhile, the book does not mention the materials on the book.

3) The coverage of syllabus is systematic

Due to the change of curriculum of syllabus, the syllabus cannot be systematic with the materials of the book. The book is chosen before the changes of the curriculum, so syllabus cannot be synchronic with the book materials systematically. On the latest syllabus, the materials are not specifically organized and written on the syllabus. Meanwhile, the book has provided 14 units systematically. It means that syllabus is not connected to the book.

4) There is good pronunciation explanation and practice

There is no audio cassette, so the material of pronunciation is not provided for students. Therefore, all units do not have good pronunciation explanation and practice.

5) There is good vocabulary explanation and practice

The textbook provides vocabulary explanation for 12 units. Meanwhile, 2 more units namely unit 3 and 11 are not included in the book. However, the practice of vocabulary is available.

6) There is good grammar presentation and practice

All units provide a grammar task or practice, but grammar presentation is not clear and detailed, so it cannot be understood by students easily. All units do not provide good grammar presentations. The grammar presentation is little explanation, and even there is nothing at all.

7) There is fluency practice in all four skills

All units provide practice in all four skills which mostly begin from read or listen followed by speak and write. It also provides grammar and vocabulary practice. The skills in English in Mind is divided into listening,

speaking, reading and writing activities. However, writing is very little than other skills.

8) The guidance is adequate for the teacher not too heavy preparation load

The book does not contain adequate guidance for the teacher. First, the textbook does not provide audio cassette for listening and pronunciation activity, so teacher should be in heavy preparation load to change the materials for it. Second, the textbook does not provide more materials in grammar activity, while the book provides many tests to complete. Therefore, teacher need to prepare more references as materials to guide students in using the textbook. The teacher could not depend only on the book.

9) There is audio cassette

The book is lent from library and there is no audio cassette given.

Discussion

Based on the result, the researcher found that the textbook "English in Mind Second Edition – Student's book 3 was classified as fair textbook to the criteria of Ur (1996). It could be seen from the level of fulfillment that was 55 score. It means that teachers may use the textbook as a reference to teach the tenth grader of senior high school.

There are 11 criteria of 20 criteria that are fulfilled by the textbook based on criteria of a good textbook proposed by Ur (1996). The first criterion is in terms of approach in the textbook. Most materials of the textbook are suitable with the target community namely senior high school students. The approach is related to teenager daily life. The materials such as diary, weekend activities, GPS, friendship, and loves are acceptable for them. They must know about it. Therefore, the textbook can be understandable for students of senior high school.

Next, the criterion is about layout of the textbook. The layout is interesting because of the clear print, colorful print and many pictures related to illustration of the text. The next criteria are about the materials or content, instructions, tasks, and language used in the textbook. Those criteria are fulfilled by the textbook.

Moreover, this textbook also fulfills the criteria where it triggers students to be independent. In spite of the weakness of the textbook which is little explanation of materials, the textbook aims to encourage students to be independent in seeking and collecting the detailed materials from many sources. Students cannot just depend on only one textbook, but they also need other sources.

The last criterion is in terms of availability of the textbook locally. This textbook has fulfilled this criterion where this textbook has been one of textbook owned by vocational school. It is lent to students for teaching and learning English. It means that this textbook has been available locally.

However, teacher still need some improvements in using this textbook for teaching and learning activity. The improvements are caused by 9 criteria which are not existed on the textbook as criteria by Ur (1996). Those nine criteria are in terms of the objectives, the topics and tasks, syllabus, pronunciation explanation and practice, grammar presentation and practice, vocabulary bank, the guidance in the textbook, fluency practice, and audio cassette.

In terms of unavailable criterion of syllabus in the textbook, it must be considered carefully because syllabus is an important component in the process of teaching and learning. Textbook must be in line with syllabus of curriculum. However, it is not easy for teachers to select the textbook which is proper with syllabus. Therefore, teacher is recommended to select some materials of task from textbook and combine with others as the rest of it in order to fulfill the syllabus of the curriculum.

D. Conclusion

After doing the study in finding whether the English textbook of technical vocational high school is suitable to Ur's criteria. The result shows that the textbook meets the criteria by Ur (1996) with score of 55. It means that this textbook has level of a fair textbook, so this textbook can be used for technical vocational high school. However, the teacher should complete the unavailable criteria of textbook by adding the materials or media from others.

Based on conclusion of this research, the researcher recommends some suggestions as follows. For English teachers, this study can be references especially for English teachers who teach senior high school. The textbook entitled "English in Mind (Second Edition) Student's Book 3" can be used as learning material but it needs little modifications namely audio of native speaker for listening and pronunciation practice, additional materials of grammar and connecting to syllabus used nowadays. For students, the students should realize that they are learning in system of Education 4.0, so students must be independent in learning. For further research, this study is still not perfect, so the researcher suggests for the next researcher to find the detailed information about this textbook by using other theories of textbook assessment.

E. References

- Abdel Wahab, M. M. (2013). Developing an English language textbook evaluative checklist. *IOSR Journal of Research & Method in Education*, 1 (3), 55-70.
- Anderson, B. (2007). Pedagogical rules and their relationship to frequency in input: Observational and empirical data from French. *Applied Linguistics*, 28(2).
- Arikunto, S. 2010. *Prosedur Penelitian Suatu Pendekatan Praktik*. Jakarta: Rineka Cipta
- Azizfar, A., Koosha, M., & Lotfi, A. (2010). An Analytical Evaluation of Iranian High School ELT Textbooks from 1990 to the present. *Social and Behavioral Sciences*.
- Asyhari, A., & Silvia, H. (2016). Pengembangan Media Pembelajaran Berupa Buletin dalam Bentuk Buku Saku untuk Pembelajaran IPA Terpadu. *Jurnal Ilmiah Pendidikan Fisika Al- Biruni*, 5(1), 1-13.
- Baluqiah, K., & Fransiska, M. (2020). LISTENING COMPREHENSION STRATEGIES EMPLOYED BY INDONESIAN EFL STUDENTS: LESSON LEARNED FROM INDONESIAN ISLAMIC HIGHER EDUCATION.
- Beare, K. (2011). How to Choose a Coursebook and Other Classroom Materials [Online]. Available .at <http://esl.about.com/cs/teachingresources/ht/coursebook.html>.
- Brown, J. D. (1995). The elements of language curriculum: A systematic

- approach to program development. Boston: Heinle & Heinle.
- Cahyani, S., & Perdana, S. (2019). Textbooks evaluation by Ur' s Theory. *Journal of English Language and Pedagogy*, 2(2), 162-171.
- Cunningworth, A. (1995). *Choosing Your Coursebook*. London: Oxford Heinemann Publishers.
- Djamarah, (2015). *Psikologi Belajar*. Jakarta ; Rineka Cipta.
- Febrina, F., Usman, B., & Muslem, A. (2019). Analysis of reading comprehension questions by using revised Bloom's taxonomy on higher order thinking skill (HOTS). *English Education Journal*, 10(1), 1-15.
- Hill, G. Mc. 2012. *Connect Learn Succeed*. New York: McGraw-Hill Companies, Inc.
- Kasihani, E.S.S. (2010). *Pengajaran Bahasa Inggris di SMK: Metode, Media, dan Asesmen*. Didaktik.
- Lestari, A. R. E., & Martiarini, E. (2021). Content Analysis of an ESP Textbook; English for Vocational High School. *Channing: Journal of English Language Education and Literature*, 6(2), 37-42
- Lie, A. (2009). Education Policy and EFL Curriculum in Indonesia: Between the Commitment to Competence and the Quest for Higher test Score. *TEFLIN Journal: A publication on the Teaching and Learning of English*. 18 (1).
- Mahsun. 2011. *Metode Penelitian Bahasa Tahapan strategi, metode, dan tekniknya*. Jakarta Utara: Rajawali Pers.
- Muliasari, D. (2018). TYPES OF READING QUESTION ANALYSIS IN ELECTRONIC SCHOOL BOOK "BAHASA INGGRIS" FOR THE TWELVE GRADE OF SENIOR HIGH SCHOOL. *Jurnal Education and Economics*, 1(4), 464-468.
- Munir, S., Suzanne, N., & Yulnetri, Y. (2021). Developing Criteria of an English Textbook Evaluation for Indonesian Senior High School. *Ta'dib*, 24(2), 217-228.
- Muslich, Masnur. (2010). *Texty Book Writing (Dasar-Dasar Pemahaman Penulisan dan Pemakaian Buku Teks)*. Jogjakarta: Ar-Ruzz Media.
- Nurcholis, I. A., Safitri, W., & Putri, R. R. (2021). STUDENTS' PERCEPTION OF ASYNCHRONOUS IN ENGLISH LEARNING DURING COVID-19 PANDEMIC. *Teaching English and Language Learning English Journal (TELLE)*, 1(3).
- Nurdeani, R. 2014. "Analisis Buku Teks Pelajaran Bahasa Inggris Berdasarkan Standar Penulisan Buku Teks Pelajaran". *Pedadidaktika: Jurnal Ilmiah Mahasiswa Pendidikan Guru Sekolah Dasar*, Vol.1, No. 1 (2014). Accessed on ejournal.upi.edu/index.php/pedadidaktika/article/view/4694.
- Peraturan Menteri Pendidikan Dan Kebudayaan Republik Indonesia Nomor 71 Tahun 2003 Pasal 1 Tentang Buku Teks Pelajaran dan Buku Panduan Guru untuk Pendidikan Dasar dan Menengah.
- Peraturan Menteri Pendidikan Nasional Republik Indonesia Nomor 2 Tahun 2008 Pasal 1 Tentang Buku.
- Permendiknas No.22 Tahun 2003 2006 Bab 2 tentang Standar Isi.
- Pinter, A. (2009). *Teaching young learners*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- PP RI No.29 Tahun 1990, tentang Pendidikan Menengah.
- Riangsari, A. 2015. *Jenis dan Tema Teks dalam Buku Siswa Bahasa Indonesia*

- Ekspresi Diri dan Akademi Kelas X serta Relevansinya dengan Kompetensi Kurikulum 2013. Surakarta: Universitas Muhammadiyah Surakarta.
- Sianturi, D. S., Situmorang, S. A., Gulo, P., & Saragih, E. (2020). An analysis of recount text in English textbooks used by tenth grade students. *Journal of Languages and Language Teaching*, 8(2), 120-127.
- Suhadi, A., Baluqiah, K., & Pertiwi, H. P. (2021). Unraveling Students' Strategies in Overcoming the Listening Comprehension Problems. *Teaching English and Language Learning English Journal (TELLE)*, 1(3).
- Suryani, R. W. (2015). "An Analysis of English Textbook Published by The Ministry of Education and Culture of Indonesia Used for Seventh Grade of Junior High School Students". English Education Department State Institute for Islamic Studies (Iain) Bukittinggi.
- Undang-Undang No.20 Tahun 2003 Tentang Sistem Pendidikan Nasional.
- Ur, P. (1991). *A Course in Language Teaching*. United Kingdom. Cambridge University Press
- Zulaicha, I. 2012. *Buku Teks dan LKS*. Accessed on <http://ika-zulaicha.blogspot.com/2012/01/buku-teks-dan-lks.html>
- Ur, P. (1996). *A course in language teaching: practice & theory* (pp. 184-187). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Widodo, H. P. (2014). Contextually framing the design of ESP materials: Vocational English reading tasks. In H. Emery & N. Moore (Eds.) *Teaching, learning and researching reading in EFL*.